



The Bre-X Story An Insider's Perspective CIM MES Discussion Group

Bryan A. Coates September 29th, 2021

- Provide an insider insight into one of Canada's most significant fraud
 - What happened
 - New measures established to avoid reoccurrence
 - Personal impact
 - Lessons learned



Bre-X Fraud

- One of the most important fraud in the mining/financial sectors
 - Market capitalization: \$6 billion
 - Acquisition target for large companies (Barrick, Placer Dome, Freeport, Teck)
 - + 70M ounces gold deposit in Indonesia
 - Junior exploration company
 - Kilborn (SNC Lavalin) Report
 - International suspense
 - Espionage, corruption (?), disclosure, etc.
 - World class advisors: JP Morgan (USA), Republic, National Bank (USA), RBC (Canada), Bennett Jones, Sullivan & Cromwell, PwC, KPMG, Kroll, etc.
 - Mining Analysts recommendations
 - Canadian & USA investment houses/brokers



Bre-X Fraud (cont'd)

- Fraud discovered during Freeport McMoran's due diligence
 - Unable to replicate drill results
- Strathcona Minerals (Graham Farquharson) was mandated to examine the allegations
 - \$1 M drilling program
 - Report issued May 4, 1997
 - « Regretfully no gold »



Bre-X Fraud (cont'd)



May 3, 1997

CONFIDENTIAL

Mr. David Walsh President and Chief Executive Officer Bre-X Minerals Ltd. 119 - 114 Street NW Calgary, AB T2N 1Z6

Dear Mr. Walsh:

Busang Technical Audit - Interim Report

Enclosed is our report covering that portion of the technical audit of work on the Busang property that we have completed to date including the very conclusive assay results from 175 core samples. We very much regret having to express the firm opinion that an economic gold deposit has not been identified in the Southeast Zone of the Busang property, and is unlikely to be.

We realize that the conclusions reached in this interim report will be a great disappointment to the many investors, employees, suppliers and the joint-venture partners associated with Bre-X, to the Government of Indonesia, and to the mining industry everywhere. However, the magnitude of the tampering with core samples that we believe has occurred and resulting falsification of assay values at Busang, is of a scale and over a period of time and with a precision that, to our knowledge, is without precedent in the history of mining anywhere in the world.

Grahun Faigubass. G. Farouharson

Telephone: (416) 869-0772

(416) 367-3638

Fac



CONSULTING



6

- 6 books published
 - The Bre-X Fraud (D. Goold & A. Willis)
 - Fool's Gold: The Making of a Global Market Fraud (B. Hutchinson)
 - Bre-X Gold Today, Gone Tomorrow (J. Whyte & V. Danielson)
 - Fever: The Dark Mystery of Bre-X Gold Rush (J. Wells)
 - Bre-X:The Inside Story (D. Francis)
 - Bre-X: Dead Man's Story (A. Lenarciak)
- Numerous articles newspapers magazines
 - Canadian Business, Fortune, etc.





 A movie « Gold » – December 2016 (Matthew McConaughey)





The Environment / Setting

- Mining is a high-risk industry
 - Commodity prices
 - Project execution
 - Estimates
 - Wealth distribution
- An industry with companies of various sizes
 - Prospectors / Junior Exploration Companies
 - Operating companies
 - Emerging (junior producers)
 - Intermediate producers
 - Senior producers
- An industry in liquidation
 - $\hfill \ensuremath{\, \bullet}$ Opening of a new mine \rightarrow depletion of resources



The Environment / Setting (cont'd)

Risk Capital

Discovery / Development

- Search for deposit → Sale / Joint venture for development
- Open industry (« ease of entry »)
- Need for significant capital to develop
- Mining of resources
 - Collective asset (ownership) / State-owned
- Industry with colorful actors / players / participants
 - « Rags to riches »
 - Relations between prospectors/promoters and senior management of established (large) companies
 - Each (world class) discovery has its intrigue and often is subject to litigation



The Voisey's Bay Story (Diamond Fields)

- Deposit discovered in 1993
 - Search for diamonds
 - Discovery of a significant nickel deposit in Labrador
- Robert Friedland
 - CEO of Diamond Fields
 - Friend of Steve Jobs
 - Exceptional promoter
 - Before Diamond Fields: a colorful past
 - Environmental incident and bankruptcy
 - Galactic Resources Summitville Mine (USA)



Robert Friedland



The Voisey's Bay Story (Diamond Fields)

Auctioned company

- Teck
- Inco
 Falconbridge
 Leaders in nickel production
- Sold to Inco in March 1996 \$4.3 billion (\$174 per share – pre-split)

Value creation at the Drill Bit (Exploration)



Diamond Fields Share Price Performance





Sale of Arequipa Resources (Peru)

- Discovery of a gold deposit by Arequipa Resources (Pierina deposit)
- Sale of Arequipa Resources to Barrick Gold for \$790 million in August 1996
 - 6,5 M ounces of gold
- One of Barrick's best mines for over 20 years





Arequipa Share Price Performance





Indonesia (1996)

- One of the most difficult jurisdictions from an ethical standpoint
 - President Suharto (dictatorship ?)
 - Wife Madame 10 % (Ms. Tien)
 - Lack of transparency
 - Corrupted bureaucrats/technocrats
- Country had world class deposits
 - Grasberg
 - Inco involved (PT Inco)
- Little knowledge in Canada and USA about Indonesian mining
- Environment was favorable to fraud



Grasberg Mine (Indonesia)

One of the world's greatest deposit with challenging conditions





Busang Project

- World class deposit
 - +70 M ounces of gold
 - Production cost less than \$100/ounce
- Region was not well known
- Promoter David Walsh (Montréal/Calgary)
- Geologist
 - John Felderhoff (Ok Tedi)
 - Filipino geological team (led by Michael De Guzman)
- Players not well known with the North American mining industry
- Other colorful participants involved (McLucas, Meruk et al.)



David Walsh, President & CEO (left) John Felderhof, Executive VP Exploration (right)



Bre-X

- New company (junior exploration company)
- Company actively promoted family business
- Operations « broche à foin » (disorganized)
- Legal and financial aspects not best practices
- Credibility increasing acceptability
 - New members of Senior Management and Directors (Francisco/Coates/Kavanagh)
 - New advisors (Bennett Jones, KPMG, Investment Bankers)



Bay Street

- Canadian and US Investment Banks
 - Major discovery
 - « Everyone wants piece of the pie »
 - Analysts wanted success
- \$\$\$ and \$\$\$ Greed
- Bay Street wanted this to happen
 - Another Voisey's Bay
 - Another Arequipa
 - Entrepreneurial succes



Transactions

- With its "exploration success" Bre-X became a highly desirable company
 - Barrick
 - Placer
 - Teck
 - Freeport
 - Etc.
- September 1996 Board mandate to find JV partner
- Pressure for auction
- Impact on Indonesia Government
- Intrigue on the property history and transfer



The Global Gold Industry (1996)

- Many major gold operating companies
 - South Africa (Goldfields, Anglo Gold)
 - Canada (Barrick, Placer Dome, Teck, Cambior, etc.)
 - USA (Newmont, Homestake, Freeport McMoran)
 - Australia (Rio Tinto, etc.)
- Barrick wanted to be the leading gold producer (No. 1)
 - Peter Munk Entrepreneur



Peter Munk Barrick Gold's Founder and Chairman



Barrick Board and International Advisory Board

Well connected members – many former leading politicians

Directors

- Howard L. Beck, Funding Partner Davies Ward & Beck
- Marshal Cohen, Former Deputy Minister of Finance
- Hon. Trevor Eyton, Member of the Senate
- Rt. Hon. Brian Mulroney
 Former Prime Minister of Canada
- Hon. Edward Ney, Former U.S. Ambassador to Canada

International Advisory Board

- Honorary Senior Advisor President George Bush (41st US President)
- Chairman
 Rt. Hon. Brian Mulroney
- Former World Leaders



Circle of Pressure





M&A Transaction

- Pressure on Bre-X to do a deal for the development of the project
 - World class operator
- Intense lobbying efforts to position bidding companies for success
 - Relationship with government
 - Pressure on advisors
- Attack on Bre-X reputation
- Story of "David versus Goliath"
 - Captivating story for media and industry players
- Small investors/coalition against certain companies



Government of Indonesia

- The Government was at the centre of negotiations
 - Minister of Mines (Sudjana)
 - Facilitator
 - President Suharto
 - External pressure
 - Bob Hassan and Freeport
- Issues related to mining titles and the "Contract of Work"
- Discussions between Bre-X and the Government
- International story/intrigue reputation
- Embarassement



One of many newspaper / magazine reports





Pressure on members of the permanent Government

COVER STORY

develop Busang, Bre-X was an exploration company, after all; Walab, Felderhof and Francisco knew nothing about production. The question was who, and at what price. Walsh opened the bidding in public last May at Bre-X's annual meeting, "We'd want a walk-in, cash payment for 25% of Busang." he told shareholdten. "I'd say, \$2 billion for the 25% sounds about right."

Pretty heady numbers for a guy who could barely scrape together gas money a few years earlier. Then again, Walsh's circumstances had rather improved. Walsh was rich beyond belief. Over the winter he sold a small chunk of his Bre-X shares, scooping up \$11.4 million. Jeannette exencised an option to buy 320,000 Bre-X shares at \$1.26, selling 70,000 of them for \$4.1 million. The couple moved to a new home in Nassau, the Bahamas, and sold their Calgary home to their sons for \$1,000. The Wakhes continued to exercise options and some of the new shares throughout 1996. By December, their holdings in Bre-X and Breses were worth \$322 million on the open market. Finally, Walsh seemed to have all his problems licked. Except one.

BUSANG, THE PLACE THAT MADE is located in one of the globe's poorest, most internally divided countries. Indenesis's population of 200 million is composed of more than 300 ethnic groups speaking 583 languages and dialecs. And this incredibly diverse population is spread over 13,677 islands, borneo, the largest of the islands, has been heavily logged. This has led to topsoil erosion and flooding, particularly devastaing during the monsoon season.

Everything that happens in this remote spot comes under the iron hand of Jakarta. Suharto, a former army general who came to power in 1966, has managed to maintain his position as president for 31 years by crushing opponents. His regime is blamed for the death of hundreds of thousands of Indonesian people who have dared to resist, or even question, his authority. Officially, Suharto says he wants to promote democracy, but civil servants are required to support him during elections, and he jails politicians and writers who don't subscribe to the official state ideology. He is an avowed enemy of communism, yet Suharto heads a militarized political machine-Golkar-that could have been conceived by the Politburo. He



has pushed Indonesia toward a modern, Weitern economy, but allows feudal practices such as nepocism and corruption to run roughshod. Especially nepotism. While millions of Indonesian citizens live in poverty—the

40 CANADIAN BUSINESS MARCH 1997



Strategic Alliance with PT Panutan Duta (Oct 1996)

- Agreement between Bre-X and Panutan Duta (Panutan Group) for advisory services – Disclosed publicly
- Group owned by the son of President Suharto (Sigit Harjojudanto)
- Mandate
 - « Under the terms of a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU), subject to the fulfillment of certain conditions, Bre-X and Bro-X have retained Panutan as a consultant to assist in administrative, technical and other support matters within the Republic of Indonesia, including the identification of issues concerning the acquisition, exploration, development and production from mineral resource properties and other interests. Bre-X and Bro-X maintain the sole right and authority to determine the method of bringing their respective properties into production, including the right to select any major mining partners. »



Strategic Agreement - Terms

- 40 months @ \$1 million/month
- 10 % of Busang (« carried interest »)
- Financing for acquisition of other participations
- Company services for Busang
 - 60 % Bre-X/Bro-X
 - 40 % Panutan Duta
- Supply contracts: « utilities, petroleum, etc. »



Strategic Agreement

• Why?



Strategic Agreement

- Because Barrick had contracted the daughter of the President Suharto (« Tutut ») as advisor
- Questions Ethics
- Extortion ?
- Corruption ?
- Justification ?
- Fiduciary duty to protect assets/company ?



Transaction – February 17, 1997

- Following a long period of discussions, an agreement occured between Bre-X and Freeport McMoran with the support of Government (Bob Hassan)
- Freeport McMoran had deep knowledge of the country
 - Operator of the Grasberg Mine
 - Close ally/friend of President Suharto (golf partner)
- Joint venture
 - Bre-X 45%
 - 2 Indonesian companies 30%
 - Republic of Indonesia 10%
 - Freeport 15%



Freeport McMoran – Due Diligence

- Freeport executed due diligence activities
 - Unable to reproduce drilling results
- Ask for explanations
- Michael de Guzman returns to Indonesia from PDAC to resolve mystery
 - He falls from helicopter on way to site (suicide? murder? disappearance? etc.)
- Meeting with Francisco/Board
 - Appointment of Strathcona Mineral Services



Independent Engineer Investigation (Strathcona)

- Strathcona Mineral Resources mandated
- "Salt job highly unlikely"
- Trip to Indonesia
- \$1 million drilling program
- Conclusion: "no economic deposit"
- Security aspects
- Others
 - Stock trading (TSX, MSX)
 - Investigation
 - International news
 - Corruption?
 - Fraud?



Graham Farquharson, President Strathcona Mineral Services



Handling of drill core




John B. Felderhof, Executive Vice President Exploration and Vice Chair





Strathcona Twin Hole Assay Results – Where is the Gold?





WHAT THE RCMP FOUND DURING THEIR RECENT VISIT TO THE BUSANG SITE



Hey! All these visitor safety glasses have rose-coloured lenses!



Source: The Northern Miner

Impact on Gold Sector - 1996-2001 was devastating





Source: The Northern Miner

Busang – Fraud – How?

- Property previous explorer no success
- No splitting core
- « Salting » of samples
- Alluvial gold used
- Opening of sample bags
- « Pool Room » to salt samples
- Special theory by de Guzman on origin of deposit
 - Maar Diatreme
- Unconventional assaying (fire assay not used – cyanide soluble leached 36 hours)





Busang – Fraud – How? (Cont'd)

Consultants' review:

- PetraScience (Anne Thompson) no gold in any samples
- Normet (90% recovery from gravity)
- Fire at Busang geological office (geology, surveying & drafting)
 - Suspicious helicopter pilot
- Young Canadian geologists questioned practices
- Closed group of geologists (De Guzman et al.)



Red Flags – G. Farquharson/Strathcona

- No gold geochemical anomaly over deposit
- No gold outcrop samples "It had been leached"
- Spotting drillholes not influenced by previous drilling
- Busang geologists never went to drill sites
- Selected core intervals designated visually as "mineralized" and received different sample treatment
- In over 60,000 m of core logging no reports of visible gold
- No gold identified in 103 petrographic samples selected to represent deposit



Red Flags – G. Farquharson/Strathcona (cont'd)

- Only "in-fill samples" designated as "non-mineralized" could be prepared at Busang
- All other sample bags delivered to Samarinda had to be opened to "confirm core logging" and check for bag breakage
- Despite backlog of samples at Samarinda and assay labs at Balikpapan awaiting samples – No samples were shipped unless "authorized"
- Mineralogical studies identified gold in metallurgical samples as being "coarse, rounded, and with gold-rich veins"
- Metallurgical test work indicated more than 90% gold recovery in gravity concentrate



Red Flags – G. Farquharson/Strathcona (cont'd)

- Metallurgical recovery was independent of finesse of grind
- Request for drillholes exclusively for metallurgical test work was denied
- Drill core not split all 14 kg of core from each two-meter sample "required" for accurate assay
- Well-equipped sample preparation facility at Busang under-utilized despite large backlog of core
- Could one deposit contain as much as 8% of the known gold resources of the world?



Regulatory Regime – Mining Sector

- Establishment of a specific framework for the mining sector
 - NI 43-101
 - Disclosure specifically required for new projects / new reserves
 - Qualified Person (« QP »)
- Standard established to protect investors and other stakeholders



Report NI 43-101

FORM 43-101F1 TECHNICAL REPORT Table of Contents

TITLE CONTENTS OF THE TECHNICAL REPORT

Title Page Date and Signature Page Table of Contents Illustrations

Item 1: Summary Item 2: Introduction Item 3: Reliance on Other Experts Item 4: Property Description and Location Item 5: Accessibility, Climate, Local Resources, Infrastructure and Physiography Item 6: History Item 7: Geological Setting and Mineralization Item 8: Deposit Types Item 9: Exploration Item 10: Drilling Item 11: Sample Preparation, Analyses and Security Item 12: Data Verification Item 13: Mineral Processing and Metallurgical Testing Item 14: Mineral Resource Estimates Item 15: Mineral Reserve Estimates Item 16: Mining Methods Item 17: Recovery Methods Item 18: Project Infrastructure Item 19: Market Studies and Contracts Item 20: Environmental Studies, Permitting and Social or Community Impact Item 21: Capital and Operating Costs Item 22: Economic Analysis Item 23: Adjacent Properties Item 24: Other Relevant Data and Information Item 25: Interpretation and Conclusions Item 26: Recommendations Item 27: References

Normetal CONSULTING

World Class Standard

Fraud – Clues/Suggestions

- Sometimes, its too great / beautiful
 - Incredible deposit ???
- Important that professionals fulfill their obligations
- Know the business/enterprise
- Better standards
- Quality of advisors and management
- Advisors sometimes "Each its own"
- Important players ("Big Boys") don't always follow the rules



Personal Impact of the Bre-X Fraud

- Young Family 4 kids (3, 7, 8, 10)
- Potential loss of my CPA designation
- No financial gain (options/shares)
- Potential future employment
- Lawsuits \$\$\$ (no D&O coverage)
- Personal safety
- SEC investigation
 - 2 days 16 hours of testimony
- Impact on personal reputation for life
 - Meeting people
 - Suspicion (guilty?) friends and family
 - Future employers (Canadian Malartic)



Conclusion

- Can it happen again?
 - Of course
 - "People do bad things"
 - Pursuing dreams
- Be cautious be curious be vigilant
- Respect your roles and your professions
 - Public confidence

Kenny Wells (CEO in Gold) - "We weren't fooled – we just did not look"

